Tourism, Communities and Sustainability under a Changing Climate: Towards Community-Based Approach in Tourism - Climate Change Nexus Studies

Jarkko Saarinen
University of Oulu, Finland
”Sustainable tourism is, perhaps, an impossible dream”

John Swarbrooke (1999: 41)

”Sustainable tourism is an idea whose time has now passed”

Richard Sharpley (2009: xviii)
In the meanwhile, elsewhere...

- “Tourism is a three-billion-a day business”
  (World Bank, 2012: 11)

- Tourism contributes 9% to global production and employs more than 220 million people across the Globe

- It is predicted that globally the number of international tourists arrivals will exceed one billion in 2012

- The simple issue is:
  ”Tourism means impacts. ”

  More tourism, more impacts!

  “Impacts may be desirable or undesirable” (Butler 1996: 290)
Content

Note: Draft Version!!!

• Why tourism?
• Why sustainability in tourism?
• The main traditions in sustainable tourism
  – Cases and challenges
• Why community perspective?
  – The role of communities
• Climate change and tourism
  – And tourism dependent communities
  – cases
• Towards community-bases approaches in Tourism and Climate Change Nexus
# The Elements Success in Tourist Destination Development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary elements</th>
<th>Secondary elements</th>
<th>‘Other elements’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>◆Accessibility</td>
<td>◆Marketing</td>
<td>*Good personnel skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Attractions</td>
<td>◆Infrastructure</td>
<td>*Accessibility to research information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>* Services</td>
<td>*Knowledge on business economy and skills</td>
<td>*Links to local economy, knowledge and communities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(partly Hall 2005)
However – ongoing factors of change challenge the conventional tourism development model:

- **sustainable tourism**: highlights the role of local people (communities), integration to local economy and regional development

- ‘new tourism’: highlights ‘authenticity’ and small scale development, quality and segment knowledge

- **Internationalisation** and **globalisation** of tourism: diversifies and raises the elements demand
Sustainability: More timely than ever before

• Focus on:
  – Limits of Growth / Limits to Growth
  – The idea of sustainability in tourism development

• Nothing new...

E.g. McMurray (1930:19):

the issue of carrying capacity is one of the “contributions geography can make” in the field of recreation and tourism research (see also Jones 1933
Sustainable Tourism: Why?

• (1) Growing tourism, increasing impacts and knowledge

• (2) The evolution of the idea of sustainable development, and

• (3) Transforming production and consumption modes in Western societies:
  • New tourism
1. Growing tourism, increasing impacts

- International Tourist Arrivals 1950-2020 (UNWTO)
• Growing tourism and impacts have led to a range of evident and potential problems
  – Concern starting from the late 1950’s and early 1960’s

• Problems created a need to manage the impacts (Lucas, 1964; Wagar, 1964; Wolfe, 1982)

• Management issues in National Parks and Wilderness areas
  – carrying capacity thinking
(2) The Evolution of Sustainable Development Idea

• Since the Brundtland Commission’s (UN) report "Our Common Future" in 1987, sustainability has been the central theme in discussions on tourism and its impacts:

  – Sustainable development is “development which meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs”
• Sustainability and sustainable development rest on three integrated elements/dimensions, plus three principles (futurity, holism and equity):
3. Transforming production and consumption

- A shift, not a total turn, from Fordist production towards post-Fordist production (Urry 1990):

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>‘Old tourism’</th>
<th>‘New tourism’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-mass tourism</td>
<td>-individual tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-passive and package</td>
<td>-active and flexible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-ordinary and familiar</td>
<td>-new and different</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-no specific environ. responsibility</td>
<td>- environmental responsibility (?) ‘Brian’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Supporting alternative products and trends

New Tourism terminology: Tourism from A to Z...

- Academic tourism
- Adventure tourism
- Agro-tourism
- Alternative tourism
- Anthro-tourism
- Appropriate tourism
- Archaeo-tourism
- Contact tourism
- Cottage tourism
- Culture tourism
- Dark tourism
- Ecotourism
- Ecological tourism
- Environmentally friendly tourism
- Ethnic tourism
- Green tourism
- Nature tourism
- Nature-based tourism
- Risk tourism
- Safari tourism
- Scientific tourism
- Soft tourism
- Sustainable tourism
- Thanatourism
- Trekking tourism
- Wilderness tourism
- Wildlife tourism

adapted from Mowforth & Munt (1998)

• alternative and new forms of tourism as a respond to the wider market demands
Sustainable Tourism: What?

• or what it is not...?
• The basic ideas and principles of sustainable development have been transferred into tourism
  – Rio 1992 / Agenda 21
• According to the (UN)WTO (1993) sustainable tourism is:
  “development that meets the needs of present tourists and host regions while it protects and enhances opportunities for the future”
Sustainable Tourism Development: General Justifications

(1) Encourages to analyse the impacts of tourism
(2) Encourages to analyse the division of positive and negative impacts of tourism: actors and places
(3) Aims to provide income and work for the destination ‘ regions and host communities
(4) Diversifies local economic basis and develops local production by supporting traditional livelihoods
(5) Produces foreign currency and capital - especially in the Third World (and peripheries)
(6) Participates local communities and actors to regional developments and economics
(7) Develops basic infrastructure
(8) Creates well-being by providing services that would be without tourism
(9) Encourages to respect, value and conserve natural and cultural heritage

(Swarbrooke 1999)
• Tens of definitions... (SD has hundreds)

• The following elements are often identified and linked to sustainable tourism:
  – Needs of the host population (benefits)
  – Satisfaction of tourists (quality) and
  – Safeguarding the natural environment (responsibility)
  – Economic viability (the industry)

• In general the goals of sustainable tourism are:
  – To maintain the quality of the environment
  – To improve the quality of life in host community
Sustainable Tourism: ‘A Red Herring’?

• Misleading ’clues’ are referring to two major issues:

  Connection to sustainable development

  Relations to development and growth
Sustainable Tourism vs Sustainable Development

• Sharpley (2000):
  – There are “significant differences between the concepts of sustainable tourism and sustainable development”

• Sharpley (2009):
  – “Need to move beyond sustainability” in tourism

• Why?
The fundamental principles of sustainable development

• Futurity
  – Climate change responses...?

• Equity
  – Benefit sharing?
    • Leakages.... (e.g. BW; tourism, mining, poverty datum line)

• Holism
  – Tourism as a geographical system
Traditions in Setting the Limits to Growth in Tourism

• The limits of/to growth in tourism are seen differently:
  – What does the limit mean? and
  – How it can be measured / identified

• Three distinctive perspectives:
  – 1. Resource-based tradition
  – 2. Activity-based tradition
  – 3. Community-based tradition

• Cases
Climate Change and Communities
Adaptation as innovation

• Increasing research and policy interest in adaptation to changing climate

• Close connection to the idea of innovation;

• the adaptation refers to the ability of a unit (e.g. a tourism operator or a community) to transform its structure, operations or organisation to survive under changes threatening its existence and success (Pielke, 1998; Kelly & Adger, 2000).

• Adaptive capacity can be understood as the ability of an unit and their networks to learn and accumulate knowledge and experience, innovations and creative flexibility in risk evaluations, decision making and problem solving (Smith & Wandel, 2006).
Changing environment: climate

• Estimated global warming by 2100 (scenario A1B)
  – Arctic: substantially greater warming than the global average:
    • 3-7°C
  – Precipitation +20%
  – Sea ice (and radiation) decline

• Direct/indirect negative and positive impacts to tourism

IPCC (2007), map: www.fmi.fi
How climate change influences tourism

Predominantly...
- Positively affected
- Slightly positively affected
- Slightly negatively affected
- Negatively affected
- Not examined

Source: DB Research

Philipp Ehmer · July 3, 2008 · page 8
Climate Change, Tourism and a Missing Link...

- The past and current adaptation studies are focusing on four main themes:
  - business;
  - consumer;
  - destination; and
  - policy and framework
- The adaptation studies in tourism have so far had limited focus on community perceptions and relations,
  - which in general have been an area of major interest in tourism research.
- By giving more emphasis to community-based research in relation to tourism and climate change, the highly contextual adaptation challenges could be met in a more sustainable way

- Cases
Conclusions?

• Community perspective: will practices meet theories...?
  • Missing link in climate changes studies (in tourism)
    • But growing in general!

• Three approaches to limit tourism
  – Resource-based: objective limit difficult to create (and too limiting for the industry?)
  – Activity-based: too relativistic and industry-oriented, does not serve environment / host communities
  – Community-based: devolution difficult, does not work with the needs of the main stream industry and its logics

• Should we forget sustainability?

• Go beyond? Where!?
  – Who said the setting the limits would simple?

• Instead of forgetting or going beyond – perhaps going a step back?
The Current Hegemonic Idea of Sustainable Tourism

• Sustainability is clearly hegemonic paradigm in tourism development discussions
  – Climate change and globalisation have highlighted the need

• Sustainable tourism is defined e.g. “tourism which is economically viable **but does not destroy the resources on which the future of tourism will depend**, notably the physical environment and the social fabric of the host community” (Swarbrooke 1999: 13)

• Sustaining tourism...
  – All forms of tourism can aim to sustainability...
• What if tourism is not the most sustainable way to use a resource...?

• Taking a step back:
  From the sustainable development perspective:
  – the sustainable use of resources,
  – the environment and communities’ well-being

are goals to which sustainable tourism could and should contribute
What should be done?

• (1) Need to de-centralise tourism in sustainable development discussions
  – Tourism as a tool, not the end
  – Communities role

• (2) Need to have indicators
  – Without indicators sustainable tourism is a ”meaningless jargon” (Wheeller, 1993)
  – Bring the limits to growth back: the revival of the carrying capacity thinking?

  carrying capacity ”is not only useful but also awkward and avoidable reality” (Butler, 2010:61)
• (3) Need to have firm policies with implementation
  – Case Ngamiland Botswana
    • Tsodilo Hills, WHS status in 2001
    • Rock Art: ‘’Louvre of the Desert‘’
    • Tourism Policy 1990 emphasis on luxury safaris:’’low volume-high value
      – ‘’Structures of expectations‘’
      – Average bed-nigh 450 EUR
      – -> under 20 % in local ownership
      – -> leakage 75 %
  
  • 2009 Policy goal: emphasis on local benefits and community participation
    – Indicators focusing solely on tourism growth – not local development and well-being
Thank You